



# GOTTLOB FREGE





**Critical Assessments of Leading Philosophers**

Other titles in the series:

*Ludwig Wittgenstein*

Edited by Stuart Shanker

*René Descartes*

Edited by Georges J. D. Moyal

*George Berkeley*

Edited by Walter E. Creery

*Martin Heidegger*

Edited by Christopher Macann

*Immanuel Kant*

Edited by Ruth Chadwick

*John Dewey*

Edited by Jim Tiles

*G. W. Leibniz*

Edited by Roger Woolhouse

*David Hume*

Edited by Stanley Tweyman

*Socrates*

Edited by William J. Prior

*Plato*

Edited and with an introduction by Nicholas D. Smith

*Nietzsche*

Edited and with an introduction by Daniel W. Conway

*Bertrand Russell*

Edited and with an introduction by Andrew Irvine

*Aristotle*

Edited and with an introduction by Lloyd P. Gerson

*Deleuze and Guattari*

Edited and with an introduction by Gary Genosko





*Spinoza*

Edited and with an introduction by Genevieve Lloyd

*Ludwig Wittgenstein*

*Second Series*

Edited and with an introduction by Stuart Shanker and David Kilfoyle

*Kierkegaard*

Edited and with an introduction by Daniel W. Conway

*Derrida*

Edited and with an introduction by Len Lawlor and Zeynep Direk

*Karl Popper*

Edited by Anthony O'Hear

*Emmanuel Levinas*

Edited and with a new introduction by Claire Katz

*Edmund Husserl*

Edited and with a new introduction by Rudolf Bernet,  
Donn Welton, and Gina Zavota







# GOTTLOB FREGE

Critical Assessments of  
Leading Philosophers

*Edited by*  
*Michael Beaney and*  
*Erich H. Reck*



**Volume I**  
**Frege's philosophy in context**

 **Routledge**  
Taylor & Francis Group  
LONDON AND NEW YORK





First published 2005  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada  
by Routledge  
270 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group*

Editorial material and selection © 2005 Michael Beaney and Erich H. Reck;  
individual owners retain copyright in their own material.

Typeset in Times by Graphicraft Limited, Hong Kong  
Printed and bound in Great Britain by

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or  
reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic,  
mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter  
invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any  
information storage or retrieval system, without permission in  
writing from the publishers.

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN 0-415-30601-9 (Set)  
ISBN 0-415-30604-3 (Volume I)

**Publisher's note**

References within each chapter are as they appear in the original complete work.



# CONTENTS

## VOLUME I FREGE'S PHILOSOPHY IN CONTEXT

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>Chronological table or reprinted articles and chapters</i>	xvii
<i>Preface</i>	xxiii

<b>General Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
-----------------------------	----------

<b>Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>
---------------------	----------

### PART 1

<b>Frege's life and work</b>	<b>21</b>
------------------------------	-----------

<b>1 Frege's life and work: chronology and bibliography</b>	<b>23</b>
---	-----------

CHRISTIAN THIEL AND MICHAEL BEANEY

<b>2 Frege in Jena: academic contacts and intellectual influences</b>	<b>40</b>
---	-----------

UWE DATHE

<b>3 The quest for Frege's <i>Nachlass</i></b>	<b>54</b>
--	-----------

KAI F. WEHMEIER AND HANS-CHRISTOPH SCHMIDT AM BUSCH

### PART 2

<b>Frege and other philosophers</b>	<b>69</b>
-------------------------------------	-----------

<b>4 Frege, Kant, and the logic in logicism</b>	<b>71</b>
---	-----------

JOHN MACFARLANE

<b>5 Existential and number statements: Herbart and Frege</b>	<b>109</b>
---	------------

GOTTFRIED GABRIEL



## CONTENTS

<b>6 Propositions in Bolzano and Frege</b>	<b>124</b>
WOLFGANG KÜNNE	
<b>7 Comments on Wolfgang Künné's paper</b>	<b>154</b>
MICHAEL DUMMETT	
<b>8 Frege, Lotze, and the continental roots of early analytic philosophy</b>	<b>161</b>
GOTTFRIED GABRIEL	
<b>9 Calculus ratiocinator versus characteristic universalis? The two traditions in logic, revisited</b>	<b>176</b>
VOLKER PECKHAUS	
<b>10 Thought and perception: the views of two philosophical innovators</b>	<b>191</b>
MICHAEL DUMMETT	
<b>11 Frege, Russell and logicism</b>	<b>213</b>
MICHAEL BEANEY	
<b>12 Frege's influence on Wittgenstein: reversing metaphysics via the context principle</b>	<b>241</b>
ERICH H. RECK	
<b>13 The reception of Frege in Poland</b>	<b>290</b>
JAN WOLEŃSKI	
<b>PART 3</b>	
<b>Frege's epistemology and metaphysics</b>	<b>311</b>
<b>14 Objectivity and objecthood: Frege's metaphysics of judgment</b>	<b>313</b>
THOMAS G. RICKETTS	
<b>15 Frege's anti-psychologism</b>	<b>340</b>
EVA PICARDI	
<b>16 Frege's 'epistemology in disguise'</b>	<b>359</b>
GOTTFRIED GABRIEL	
<b>17 Judgment and truth in Frege</b>	<b>375</b>
MICHAEL KREMER	
<b>18 Frege – A platonist or a neo-Kantian?</b>	<b>409</b>
WOLFGANG CARL	





CONTENTS

VOLUME II FREGE'S PHILOSOPHY OF LOGIC

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>PART 4</b>	
<b>Frege's logic</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>19 'Not arbitrarily and out of a craze for novelty': the Begriffsschrift 1879 and 1893</b>	<b>13</b>
CHRISTIAN THIEL	
<b>20 Frege and Hilbert on consistency</b>	<b>29</b>
PATRICIA A. BLANCHETTE	
<b>21 Frege's conception of logic</b>	<b>50</b>
WARREN GOLDFARB	
<b>22 Logical operators in <i>Begriffsschrift</i></b>	<b>69</b>
GORDON BAKER	
<b>23 Metaperspectives and internalism in Frege</b>	<b>85</b>
PETER SULLIVAN	
<b>PART 5</b>	
<b>Frege and metalogic</b>	<b>107</b>
<b>24 Truth and metatheory in Frege</b>	<b>109</b>
JASON STANLEY	
<b>25 Frege's 1906 foray into metalogic</b>	<b>136</b>
THOMAS RICKETTS	
<b>26 Frege's new science</b>	<b>156</b>
ALDO ANTONELLI AND ROBERT MAY	
<b>27 Metatheory and mathematical practice in Frege</b>	<b>190</b>
JAMIE TAPPENDEN	





## CONTENTS

<b>37</b>	<b>Frege and the rigorization of analysis</b>	<b>50</b>
	WILLIAM DEMOPOULOS	
<b>38</b>	<b>Extending knowledge and ‘fruitful concepts’: Fregean themes in the foundations of mathematics</b>	<b>67</b>
	JAMIE TAPPENDEN	
<b>39</b>	<b>Frege versus Cantor and Dedekind: on the concept of number</b>	<b>115</b>
	W. W. TAIT	
<b>40</b>	<b>Ghost world: A context for Frege’s context principle</b>	<b>157</b>
	MARK WILSON	
	<b>PART 9</b>	
	<b>Frege’s views on numbers and value-ranges</b>	<b>177</b>
<b>41</b>	<b>A theory of complex numbers in the spirit of <i>Grundgesetze</i></b>	<b>179</b>
	PETER SIMONS	
<b>42</b>	<b>The Significance of complex numbers for Frege’s philosophy of mathematics</b>	<b>198</b>
	ROBERT BRANDOM	
<b>43</b>	<b>Truth-values and courses-of-value in Frege’s <i>Grundgesetze</i></b>	<b>218</b>
	THOMAS RICKETTS	
<b>44</b>	<b>The Philosophical basis of our knowledge of number</b>	<b>245</b>
	WILLIAM DEMOPOULOS	
<b>45</b>	<b>Frege’s natural numbers: motivations and modifications</b>	<b>270</b>
	ERICH H. RECK	
	<b>PART 10</b>	
	<b>Consistency, Frege’s theorem and neo-logicism</b>	<b>303</b>
<b>46</b>	<b>The consistency of Frege’s <i>foundations of arithmetic</i></b>	<b>305</b>
	GEORGE BOOLOS	
<b>47</b>	<b>The Development of arithmetic in Frege’s <i>Grundgesetze der Arithmetik</i></b>	<b>323</b>
	RICHARD G. HECK, JR.	
<b>48</b>	<b>On the philosophical significance of Frege’s theorem</b>	<b>349</b>
	CRISPIN WRIGHT	





CONTENTS

<b>49 Neo-Fregean foundations for real analysis: some reflections on Frege's constraint</b>	<b>387</b>
CRISPIN WRIGHT	

**VOLUME IV FREGE'S PHILOSOPHY OF THOUGHT  
AND LANGUAGE**

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
-------------------------	-----

<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
---------------------	----------

<b>PART 11</b>	
<b>Frege and the philosophy of language</b>	<b>11</b>

<b>50 Generality, meaning, and sense in Frege</b>	<b>13</b>
THOMAS G. RICKETTS	

<b>51 Frege on sense and linguistic meaning</b>	<b>37</b>
TYLER BURGE	

<b>52 How 'Russellian' was Frege?</b>	<b>68</b>
DAVID BELL	

<b>53 Frege on meaning</b>	<b>81</b>
HANS SLUGA	

<b>54 Has Frege a philosophy of language?</b>	<b>97</b>
JOAN WEINER	

<b>PART 12</b>	
<b>Concepts and predication</b>	<b>125</b>

<b>55 Frege's theory of predication: an elaboration and defense, with some new applications</b>	<b>127</b>
IAN RUMFITT	

<b>56 Frege's sharpness requirement</b>	<b>160</b>
GARY KEMP	



## CONTENTS

<b>57</b>	<b>Why Frege does not deserve his grain of salt: a note on the paradox of ‘the concept horse’ and the ascription of <i>Bedeutungen</i> to predicates</b>	<b>177</b>
	CRISPIN WRIGHT	
<b>58</b>	<b>On Fregean elucidation</b>	<b>197</b>
	JOAN WEINER	
<b>PART 13</b>		
	<b><i>Sinn and Bedeutung</i></b>	<b>215</b>
<b>59</b>	<b>Frege’s puzzle, sense, and information content</b>	<b>217</b>
	WILLIAM W. TASCHEK	
<b>60</b>	<b>The context principle: centre of Frege’s philosophy</b>	<b>245</b>
	MICHAEL DUMMETT	
<b>61</b>	<b>Frege on ‘I’, ‘now’, ‘today’ and some other linguistic devices</b>	<b>262</b>
	EDWARD HARCOURT	
<b>62</b>	<b><i>Sinn, Bedeutung</i> and the paradox of analysis</b>	<b>288</b>
	MICHAEL BEANEY	
<b>PART 14</b>		
	<b>The analysis of thoughts</b>	<b>311</b>
<b>63</b>	<b>Thoughts</b>	<b>313</b>
	DAVID BELL	
<b>64</b>	<b>More about thoughts</b>	<b>330</b>
	MICHAEL DUMMETT	
<b>65</b>	<b>Decomposition and analysis in Frege’s <i>Grundgesetze</i></b>	<b>351</b>
	GREGORY LANDINI	
<b>66</b>	<b><i>Grundlagen</i> §64</b>	<b>376</b>
	BOB HALE	
<b>67</b>	<b>Analysis and decomposition in Frege and Russell</b>	<b>392</b>
	JAMES LEVINE	





## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The publishers would like to thank the following for permission to reprint their material:

Kai F. Wehmeier and Hans-Christoph Schmidt am Busch for permission to reprint ‘The Quest for Frege’s *Nachlass*’, translation of ‘Auf der Suche nach Freges Nachlaß’, in G. Gabriel and U. Dathe (eds), *Gottlob Frege – Werk und Wirkung*, Paderborn: mentis Verlag, 2000, pp. 267–281. Reprinted by permission of mentis Verlag.

John MacFarlane, ‘Frege, Kant, and the Logic in Logicism’, from *The Philosophical Review* 111 (2002). Copyright © 2002 Cornell University. Reprinted by permission of the publisher and the author.

Königshausen and Neumann for permission to reprint Gottfried Gabriel, ‘Existential and Number Statements: Herbart and Frege’, translation of ‘Existenz- und Zahlaussage. Herbart und Frege’, in A. Hoeschen and L. Schneider (eds), *Herbarts Kultursystem. Perspektiven der Transdisziplinarität IM 19. Jahrhundert*, Würzburg: Königshausen and Neumann, 2001, pp. 149–162.

Rodopi for permission to reprint Wolfgang Künne, ‘Propositions in Bolzano and Frege’, in W. Künne, M. Siebel and M. Textor (eds), *Bolzano and Analytic Philosophy*, Grazer Philosophische Studien 53, Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1997, pp. 203–240.

Rodopi for permission to reprint Michael Dummett, ‘Comments on Wolfgang Künne’s paper’, in W. Künne, M. Siebel and M. Textor (eds), *Bolzano and Analytic Philosophy*, Grazer Philosophische Studien 53, Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1997, pp. 241–248

‘Frege, Lotze, and the Continental Roots of Early Analytic Philosophy’ by Gottfried Gabriel from *From Frege to Wittgenstein*, edited by Erich H. Reck, copyright 2001 Oxford University Press, Inc. Used by permission of Oxford University Press, Inc.



#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Taylor & Francis for permission to reprint Volker Peckhaus, 'Calculus ratiocinator versus characteristica universalis? The two traditions in logic, revisited', *History and Philosophy of Logic* 25 (February 2004): 3–14.

Blackwell Publishing for permission to reprint Michael Dummett, 'Thought and Perception: The Views of Two Philosophical Innovators', in D. Bell and N. Cooper (eds), *The Analytic Tradition: Meaning, Thought, and Knowledge*, Oxford: Blackwell, 1990, pp. 83–103.

Cambridge University Press for permission to reprint Michael Beaney, 'Frege and Russell', shortened and revised version of 'Russell and Frege', in N. Griffin (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Bertrand Russell*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003, pp. 128–170.

Open Court Publishing Company for permission to reprint a shortened version of Erich H. Reck, 'Frege's Influence on Wittgenstein: Reversing Metaphysics via the Context Principle'. Reprinted by permission of Open Court Publishing Company, a division of Carus Publishing Company, Peru, IL, from *Early Analytic Philosophy: Frege, Russell, Wittgenstein*, edited by W. W. Tait, copyright © 1997 by Open Court Publishing Company.

Taylor & Francis for permission to reprint Jan Woleński, 'The reception of Frege in Poland', *History and Philosophy of Logic* 25 (February 2004): 37–51.

Kluwer Academic Publishers for permission to reprint, Thomas G. Ricketts, 'Objectivity and objecthood: Frege's metaphysics of judgment', in L. Haaparanta and J. Hintikka (eds), *Frege Synthesized*, Dordrecht: Reidel, 1986.

Walter de Gruyter GMBH & Co. for permission to reprint Eva Picardi, 'Frege's Anti-Psychologism', in M. Schirn (ed.), *Frege: Importance and Legacy*, Berlin: de Gruyter, 1996.

Walter de Gruyter GMBH & Co. for permission to reprint Gottfried Gabriel, 'Frege's "Epistemology in Disguise"', in M. Schirn (ed.), *Frege: Importance and Legacy*, Berlin: de Gruyter, 1996.

Kremer, Michael, 'Judgment and Truth in Frege', *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 38(4) (October 2000): 549–581. © Journal of the History of Philosophy, Inc. Reprinted with permission of The John Hopkins University Press.

Wolfgang Carl, 'Frege – A Platonist or a Neo-Kantian?', in A. Newen, U. Nortmann and R. Stuhlmann-Laeisz (eds), *Building on Frege: New Essays on Sense, Content, and Concept*, Stanford: CSLI Publications, 2001. Reprinted with permission from CSLI Publications. © 2001 by CSLI Publications, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305-4115.





## Chronological table of reprinted articles and chapters

Date	Author	Article/Chapter	References	Vol.	Chap.
1986	Thomas G. Ricketts	Objectivity and objecthood: Frege's metaphysics of judgment	L. Haaparanta and J. Hintikka (eds), <i>Frege Synthesized</i> , Dordrecht: Reidel, pp. 65–95.	I	14
1986	Thomas G. Ricketts	Generality, meaning, and sense in Frege	<i>Pacific Philosophical Quarterly</i> 67: 172–195.	IV	50
1987	George Boolos	The Consistency of Frege's <i>Foundations of Arithmetic</i>	Judith Jarvis Thomson (ed.), <i>On Being and Saying: Essays in honor of Richard Cartwright</i> , Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, pp. 3–20.	III	46
1987	David Bell	Thoughts	<i>Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic</i> 28(1) (January): 36–50.	IV	63
1989	Michael Dummett	More about Thoughts	<i>Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic</i> 30(1): 1–19.	IV	64
1990	Michael Dummett	Thought and Perception: The Views of Two Philosophical Innovators	D. Bell and N. Cooper (eds), <i>The Analytic Tradition: Meaning, Thought, and Knowledge</i> , Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 83–103.	I	10
1990	Tyler Burge	Frege on Sense and Linguistic Meaning	D. Bell and N. Cooper (eds), <i>The Analytic Tradition: Meaning, Thought, and Knowledge</i> , Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 30–60.	IV	51
1990	David Bell	How 'Russellian' was Frege?	<i>Mind</i> 99 (April): 267–277.	IV	52
1992	Mark Wilson	Frege: The Royal Road from Geometry	<i>Noûs</i> 26(2): 149–180.	III	36
1992	William W. Taschek	Frege's Puzzle, Sense, and Information Content	<i>Mind</i> 101 (October): 767–791.	IV	59
1993	Richard G. Heck, Jr.	The Development of Arithmetic in Frege's <i>Grundgesetze der Arithmetik</i>	<i>The Journal of Symbolic Logic</i> 58: 579–601.	III	47
1994	William Demopoulos	Frege and the Rigorization of Analysis	<i>Journal of Philosophical Logic</i> 23: 225–246.	III	37

## Chronological Table continued

Date	Author	Article/Chapter	Reference	Vol.	Chap.
1994	Ian Rumfitt	Frege's Theory of Predication: An Elaboration and Defense, with Some New Applications	<i>The Philosophical Review</i> 103(4): 599–637.	IV	55
1995	Christian Thiel	'Not arbitrarily and out of a craze for novelty': the Begriffsschrift 1879 and 1893	I. Max and W. Stelzner (eds), <i>Logik und Mathematik: Frege-Kolloquium Jena 1993</i> , Berlin: de Gruyter, pp. 20–37, translated by Michael Beaney. <i>Notis</i> 29: 427–467.	II	19
1995	Jamie Tappenden	Extending Knowledge and 'Fruitful Concepts': Fregean Themes in the Foundations of Mathematics		III	38
1995	Peter Simons	A Theory of Complex Numbers in the Spirit of <i>Grundgesetze</i>	I. Max and W. Stelzner (eds), <i>Logik und Mathematik: Frege-Kolloquium Jena 1993</i> , Berlin: de Gruyter, pp. 93–111.	III	41
1995	Michael Dummett	The Context Principle: Centre of Frege's Philosophy	I. Max and W. Stelzner (eds), <i>Logik und Mathematik: Frege-Kolloquium Jena 1993</i> , Berlin: de Gruyter, pp. 3–19.	IV	60
1996	Eva Picardi	Frege's Anti-Psychologism	M. Schirn (ed.), <i>Frege: Importance and Legacy</i> , Berlin: de Gruyter, pp. 307–329.	I	15
1996	Gottfried Gabriel	Frege's 'Epistemology in Disguise'	M. Schirn (ed.), <i>Frege: Importance and Legacy</i> , Berlin: de Gruyter, pp. 330–346.	I	16
1996	Patricia A. Blanchette	Frege and Hilbert on consistency	<i>Journal of Philosophy</i> 93(7): 317–336.	II	20
1996	Jason Stanley	Truth and metatheory in Frege	<i>Pacific Philosophical Quarterly</i> 77: 45–70.	II	24
1996	Thomas Ricketts	Logic and Truth in Frege	<i>Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplement</i> 70: 121–140.	II	28
1996	James Levine	Logic and Truth in Frege	<i>Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society Supplement</i> 70: 141–175, revised and shortened by the author.	II	29
1996	Robert Brandom	The significance of complex numbers for Frege's philosophy of mathematics	<i>Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society</i> 94: 293–315.	III	42



CHRONOLOGICAL TABLE

1996 Gary Kemp	Frege's sharpness requirement	<i>The Philosophical Quarterly</i> 46(183): 168–184.	IV	56
1996 Gregory Landini	Decomposition and Analysis in Frege's <i>Grundgesetze</i>	<i>History and Philosophy of Logic</i> 17: 121–139.	IV	65
1997 Wolfgang Kühne	Propositions in Bolzano and Frege	W. Kühne, M. Siebel and M. Textor (eds), <i>Bolzano and Analytic Philosophy</i> , Grazer Philosophische Studien 53, Amsterdam: Rodopi, pp. 203–240.	I	6
1997 Michael Dummett	Comments on Wolfgang Kühne's paper	W. Kühne, M. Siebel and M. Textor (eds), <i>Bolzano and Analytic Philosophy</i> , Grazer Philosophische Studien 53, Amsterdam: Rodopi, pp. 241–248.	I	7
1997 Erich H. Reck	Frege's Influence on Wittgenstein: Reversing Metaphysics via the Context Principle	Shortened and revised version of the same in W. W. Tait (ed.), <i>Early Analytic Philosophy: Frege, Russell, Wittgenstein</i> , Chicago: Open Court, pp. 123–185.	I	12
1997 Jamie Tappenden	Metatheory and Mathematical Practice in Frege	<i>Philosophical Topics</i> 25: 213–264, revised and shortened by the author.	II	27
1997 W. W. Tait	Frege versus Cantor and Dedekind: on the concept of number	W. W. Tait (ed.), <i>Early Analytic Philosophy: Frege, Russell, Wittgenstein</i> , Chicago: Open Court, pp. 213–249.	III	39
1997 Thomas Ricketts	Truth-values and courses-of-value in Frege's <i>Grundgesetze</i>	W. W. Tait (ed.), <i>Early Analytic Philosophy: Frege, Russell, Wittgenstein</i> , Chicago: Open Court, pp. 187–211.	III	43
1997 Crispin Wright	On the Philosophical Significance of Frege's Theorem	R. Heck (ed.), <i>Language, Thought, and Logic</i> , Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 201–244.	III	48
1997 Hans Sluga	Frege on meaning	H.-J. Glock (ed.), <i>The Rise of Analytic Philosophy</i> , Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 17–34.	IV	53
1997 Joan Weiner	Has Frege a philosophy of language?	W. W. Tait (ed.), <i>Early Analytic Philosophy: Frege, Russell, Wittgenstein</i> , Chicago: Open Court, pp. 249–272.	IV	54
1997 Bob Hale	<i>Grundlagen</i> §64	<i>Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society</i> 97: 243–261.	IV	66
1998 Thomas Ricketts	Frege's 1906 Foray into Metalogic	<i>Philosophical Topics</i> 25 (Fall): 169–188.	II	25
1998 Tyler Burge	Frege on Knowing the Foundation	<i>Mind</i> 107 (April): 305–347.	II	32



## Chronological Table continued

Date	Author	Article/Chapter	Reference	Vol.	Chap.
1998	William Demopoulos	The Philosophical Basis of Our Knowledge of Number	<i>Notis</i> 32(4): 481–503.	III	44
1998	Crispin Wright	Why Frege Does Not Deserve His Grain of Salt: A Note on the Paradox of ‘The Concept Horse’ and the Ascription of <i>Bedeutungen</i> to Predicates	J. Brandl and P. Sullivan (eds), <i>Grazer Philosophische Studien</i> 55, <i>New Essays on the Philosophy of Michael Dummett</i> , Vienna: Rodopi, pp. 239–263.	IV	57
1999	Edward Harcourt	Frege on ‘I’, ‘now’, ‘today’ and some other linguistic devices	<i>Synthese</i> 121: 329–356.	IV	61
2000	Kai F. Wehmeier and Hans-Christoph Schmidt am Busch	The Quest for Frege’s <i>Nachlass</i>	Translation of ‘Auf der Suche nach Freges Nachlaß’, Gabriel and U. Dathe (eds), <i>Gottlob Frege – Werk und Wirkung</i> , Paderborn: mentis, pp. 267–281, translated by Kai F. Wehmeier.	I	3
2000	Michael Kremer	Judgment and Truth in Frege	<i>Journal of the History of Philosophy</i> 38(4) (October): 549–581.	I	17
2000	Aldo Antonelli and Robert May	Frege’s new science	<i>Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic</i> 41(3): 242–270.	II	26
2000	Crispin Wright	Neo-Fregean foundations for real analysis: some reflections on Frege’s constraint	<i>Notre Dame Journal of Formal Logic</i> 41(4): 317–334.	III	49
2001	Gottfried Gabriel	Existential and Number Statements: Herbart and Frege	Translation of ‘Existenz- und Zahlaussage. Herbart und Frege: Perspektiven der Transdisziplinarität im 19. Jahrhundert’, in A. Hoeschen and L. Schneider (eds), <i>Herbarts Kultursystem</i> , Würzburg: Königshausen and Neumann, pp. 149–162, translated by Christian Kästner.	I	5
2001	Gottfried Gabriel	Frege, Lotze, and the Continental Roots of Early Analytic Philosophy	A. Newen, U. Nortmann and R. Stuhlmann-Laeisz (eds), <i>Building on Frege: New Essays on Sense, Content, and Concept</i> , Stanford: CSLI Publications, pp. 19–33.	I	8

## CHRONOLOGICAL TABLE

## CHRONOLOGICAL TABLE

2001	Wolfgang Carl	Frege – A Platonist or a Neo-Kantian?	A. Newen, U. Nortmann and R. Stuhlmann-Laeisz (eds), <i>Building on Frege: New Essays on Sense, Content, and Concept</i> , Stanford: CSLI Publications, pp. 3–18.	I	18
2001	Warren Goldfarb	Frege's Conception of Logic	J. Floyd and S. Shieh (eds), <i>Future Pasts: The Analytic Tradition in Twentieth-Century Philosophy</i> , Oxford University Press, pp. 25–41.	II	21
2001	Robin Jeshion	Frege's Notions of Self-Evidence	<i>Mind</i> 110 (October): 937–976.	II	33
2001	Joan Weiner	On Fregean Elucidation	Revised version of 'Theory and Elucidation: the end of the Age of Innocence', in J. Floyd and S. Shieh (eds), <i>Future Pasts: The Analytic Tradition in Twentieth-Century Philosophy</i> , New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 43–65.	IV	58
2002	John MacFarlane	John MacFarlane, 'Frege, Kant, and the Logic in Logicism	<i>The Philosophical Review</i> 111(1) (January): 25–65.	I	4
2002	Hans Sluga	Frege on the Indefinability of Truth	E. Reek (ed.), <i>From Frege to Wittgenstein: Perspectives on Early Analytic Philosophy</i> , Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 75–95.	II	30
2002	James Levine	Analysis and decomposition in Frege and Russell	<i>The Philosophical Quarterly</i> 52(207) (April): 195–216.	IV	67
2003	Michael Beaney	Frege, Russell and Logicism	Shortened and revised version of 'Russell and Frege', in N. Griffin (ed.), <i>The Cambridge Companion to Bertrand Russell</i> , Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 128–170.	I	11
2003	Dirk Greimann	Frege's Understanding of 'Truth'	Translation of 'Freges Grundverständnis von Wahrheit', in D. Greimann (ed.), <i>Das Wahre und das Falsche: Studien zu Freges Auffassung von Wahrheit</i> , Hildesheim: Georg Olms, pp. 59–79, translated by Dirk Greimann.	II	31
2004	Volker Peckhaus	Calculus ratiocinator versus characteristic universalis? The two traditions in logic, revisited'	<i>History and Philosophy of Logic</i> 25 (February): 3–14.	I	9

## CHRONOLOGICAL TABLE

## Chronological Table continued

Date	Author	Article/Chapter	Reference	Vol.	Chap.
2004	Jan Woleński	The reception of Frege in Poland	<i>History and Philosophy of Logic</i> 25 (February): 37–51.	I	13
2004	Peter Sullivan	Metaperspectives and internalism in Frege'	Extracted and revised from 'Frege's Logic', in D. M. Gabbay and J. Woods (eds), <i>Handbook of the History and Philosophy of Logic</i> , Vol. 3, Amsterdam: Elsevier, pp. 671–762.	II	23
2004	Joan Weiner	What was Frege Trying to Prove? A Response to Jeshion'	<i>Mind</i> 113 (January): 115–129.	II	34
2004	Robin Jeshion	Frege: Evidence for Self-Evidence	<i>Mind</i> 113 (January): 131–138.	II	35
2005	Christian Thiel and Michael Beaney	Frege's life and work: chronology and bibliography	Published for the first time in this collection.	I	1
2005	Uwe Dathe	Frege in Jena: Academic Contacts and Intellectual Influences	Translated by Uwe Dathe and Michael Beaney.	I	2
2005	Gordon Baker	Logical Operators in <i>Begriffsschrift</i>	Published for the first time in this collection.	II	22
2005	Mark Wilson	Ghost World: a context for Frege's context principle	Published for the first time in this collection.	III	40
2005	Erich H. Reck	Frege's natural numbers: motivations and modifications	Published for the first time in this collection.	III	45
2005	Michael Beaney	<i>Sinn, Bedeutung</i> and the Paradox of Analysis	Published for the first time in this collection.	IV	62



## PREFACE

In preparing this collection, we have consulted as widely as possible with Frege scholars across the world. The first full draft of the list of contents was drawn up in July 2003 when we met in Erlangen, Germany; we are indebted to Christian Thiel for his help both then and subsequently. We have also benefited from the advice of many of the contributors, who sent us copies of their papers and made suggestions as to what best represented their work. We are particularly grateful to those who made revisions to their original papers, contributed new material or made or checked through translations of their work (in the case of papers originally written in German). Our aim was to produce the definitive collection of papers on Frege, covering all aspects of his philosophy, in the period from 1986 to 2004. Whether or not we have succeeded in doing so, however, we are convinced that it demonstrates the vigour of work in this area and the profound importance of Frege's philosophy.

We would also like to thank the staff at Routledge who have guided the project through its various phases; in particular, to Natalie Foster and to the three Development Editors, Jennifer Lovel, Zoe Botterill and Jessica Spencer. Michael Beaney would like to acknowledge the support provided by the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation and the Institut für Philosophie of the University of Erlangen-Nürnberg during his stay in Germany in the summer of 2003 and the Open University in allowing him periods of research leave at certain key stages. Erich Reck is grateful to the University of California, Riverside, for granting him a term of research leave while working on this project; he is also indebted to Leonard Linsky, for awakening his interest in Frege originally, and to Thomas Ricketts for deepening that interest. We would both like to thank Gottfried Gabriel for turning the philosophy department at the University of Jena, Germany, into an inviting place for Frege scholars from around the world and for the help that he has given on this project. Last, but not least, we are grateful to our families, for putting up with email activities out of normal working hours as we endeavoured to communicate across an ocean and a continent.

Michael Beaney and Erich H. Reck  
February 2005

